

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Tuesday, February 5, 2019
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: **City Commission Chambers, City Hall**

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order
- II. Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of:
December 4, 2018
- III. New Business
Case 2019-1 – 283 Houston – Windows
- IV. Old Business
- V. Other Business
HDC Local Standards Review – New Construction, Porches and Decks (Worksession)
March 2019 HDC Training Opportunities
- VI. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETING OF THE
CITY COMMISSION AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting, upon twenty-four hour notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or calling the following: Ann Marie Cummings, City Clerk at 933 Terrace Street, Muskegon, MI 49440 or by calling (231) 724-6705 or TTY/TDD: Dial 7-1-1 and request that representative dial 231-724-6705

II. MINUTES

CITY OF MUSKEGON **HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION** **MINUTES**

December 4, 2018

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, S. Radtke, L. Wood, D. Warren, A. Riegler

MEMBERS ABSENT: K. Panozzo, excused; S. Kroes

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: F. Peterson, City Manager

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of October 2, 2018 and November 6, 2018 was made by J. Hilt, supported by S. Radtke and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2018-42 – 240, 250, 254 Monroe Ave. New Construction. Applicant: City of Muskegon/Dave Dusendang Custom Homes. District: Houston. Current Function: Vacant Lot. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to construct six rowhouses on three vacant lots on the north side of Monroe Avenue between 3rd Street and 4th Street (four additional rowhouses will be built across the street on 235 and 239 Monroe, but those will not be located in an historic district). The units are of modular construction, and will have attached garages accessed from the rear alley. The project is in partnership with the City of Muskegon, similar to the Midtown Square development, and aims to add new and varied housing options to the near downtown Nelson neighborhood. Updated renderings were provided to board members at the meeting.

J. Hilt asked what the back of the houses would look like. F. Peterson stated that most of the rear view of the units would consist of an attached garage, but there would be windows upstairs. He explained the modular construction of the units, stating that they would be built off-site then transported and assembled on the lots. This limited the construction time and its impact on the neighborhood. However, the modular construction would also limit the design options versus a stick-built home. Two exterior design options and indoor floor plans were reviewed by staff and board members. Board members liked the design with a garden level and steps leading to the front door but acknowledged that the steps could cause accessibility issues. F. Peterson explained Federal regulations concerning accessibility/visitability. A. Riegler stated that the windows did not look proportionate to the other features of the house. J. Hilt suggested that the windows should be moved closer to the center and more evenly spaced. F. Peterson stated that if the renderings did not meet HDC

standards, he would explain to the City Commission what it would take to meet those guidelines. S. Radtke asked what the garages would look like. F. Peterson stated that they would be one-stall garages with a gable roof, connected to the back of the home. L. Wood asked if there would be additional parking for the units. F. Peterson stated that there would be room for cars in the back of the units and in the driveway. A. Riegler agreed that the front windows needed to come in more toward the center. S. Radtke didn't like the false roofline shown on one of the renderings. A. Riegler asked what the HDC was being asked to approve. F. Peterson stated that he was looking for some direction to go back to the developer with so they could come back before the board in January with revised drawings. He asked if the renderings were reasonably approvable and the board concurred that they were, with the exception of window placement and the false roofline.

A motion that the HDC approve the concept of building six modular rowhouses on the vacant lots at 240, 250, and 254 Monroe Avenue but table the approval until revised drawings were presented based on input given by board members at this meeting, was made by S. Radtke, supported by A. Riegler and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, S. Radtke, L. Wood, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

None

OTHER

HDC Local Standards Review – Residing and Trim Cladding, Roofing – J. Pesch stated that there were grants available through the State Historic Preservation Office, but the board could not apply for those until they updated their standards and became certified by the state. Board members discussed the standards for siding, trim cladding and roofing, and concurred that siding was an important consideration. S. Radtke suggested removing the reference to asbestos cement shingles and adding wording regarding metal roofs, since they were becoming popular. He was opposed to standing-seam roofs but thought that stamped metal roofs were acceptable. A. Riegler suggested removing the references to color, since the HDC did not regulate color; Federal standards did not address color, and local standards could not be more restrictive than Federal standards. Board members concurred that they would vote on the new language at the next meeting, once J. Pesch incorporated the board's suggestions. J. Pesch stated that the sections to review for the next meeting would be New Construction and Porches & Decks.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

III. NEW BUSINESS

Case 2019-1 – 283 Houston – Windows
Applicant: Debra Tober
District: Houston
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to replace fourteen (14) windows on the structure with new, vinyl windows. The existing windows have wood frames, and some are broken or no longer operable. All proposed new windows will match the placement and size of the existing windows, and those proposed for the front of the house will also match the mullion style of the existing windows.



Standards

General

These guidelines pertain only to proposed changes to the structure and do not affect existing construction.

These guidelines are primarily directed toward the front and side elevations of the structure. Greater variances and more leniency may be extended toward proposed changes to the rear elevation of the building by the Commission. All desired or proposed changes should be referred to the Historic District Commission for consideration. Extenuating circumstances, the effect upon the architecture of

the particular structure together with the general effect upon the surrounding structures, variables in architectural design, or the effect upon usage and viability of the structure could dictate a variance from these guidelines.

No exterior doors, windows, or exterior woodwork shall be altered, removed, relocated, or added without Historic District Commission approval.

Existing exterior window or door casings, sills, and caps shall not be altered from the original design or appearance. Damaged or deteriorated wood shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Damaged or deteriorated wood elements may be replaced or covered with formed aluminum or vinyl, subject to Commission approval and provided that the original profile of the woodwork is not altered or changed.

Primary Windows

Existing damaged or deteriorating window frames and sash shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Metal or vinyl replacement windows may be acceptable provided they match the original windows in design and type and that they consist of or are painted an appropriate color. Bare metal finishes generally will not be acceptable.

The size of glass lites and muntin arrangements shall not be altered without Commission approval. Special glazing, such as stained or leaded art glass, shall not be removed without Commission approval. Unusual decorative windows such as Palladian windows, oriels, bays, Gothic arch or segment tops, etc. shall not be removed or altered.

Storm Windows

Wood storm and screen windows are the most appropriate for use in the historic district. Other types of storm, screen, or combination windows will be approved provided that the new storm window mullions align with the mullions of the primary windows. Blind stop storm and screen windows (where such windows are placed inside the existing window frames rather than affixed to the exterior of the frames) are preferable and may be required in some instances. Bare metal storm and screen windows must be painted to match or complement the trim. Interior storm windows may be acceptable as long as they do not detract from the appearance of the primary windows. Care should be taken, however, when using interior storm windows because condensation tends to form on the inside surface of the primary window and could cause damage to the wood and paint if not properly ventilated.

Primary Doors

Every effort should be made to preserve or repair the original doors where damage has occurred. When repair is not possible, the first choice shall be a similar salvaged door from a structure of the approximate age and style. A new wood door may be used when a salvaged door is not available. Such new door shall match the original in detail and finish.

The Commission may approve new wood doors that may slightly differ from the original in cases where replicating the original may not be feasible, as long as such doors generally conform to the

ones illustrated on the attached sheet. Under certain circumstances, the Commission may approve doors made of material other than wood provided they conform to the same design requirements.

Storm Doors

Wooden storm and screen doors are preferred and will generally be the required option especially on the front of the structure. Aluminum or metal storm and screen doors may be used so long as they are not mill finished or anodized aluminum. Baked enamel or other applicable paints or finishes will be acceptable. In general, storm and screen doors shall conform to those illustrated on an attached sheet. The door stiles and rails should be a minimum of 4" wide and one lite doors, where practical, are preferred in order not to detract from the existing primary door. Jalousie doors are not acceptable for use as storm doors in the historic districts. Ornamental iron work safety doors are also generally inappropriate in the historic districts.

Exterior Woodwork

Existing decorative woodwork such as railings, moldings, eave, and gable cornice trim, tracery, columns, observatories, scrolls, bargeboards, lattice, and other carved or sawn wood ornament shall not be removed or altered without Commission approval. Existing deteriorated ornamental woodwork shall not be removed but shall be repaired or replaced with matching materials where possible.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to replace fourteen (14) windows on the structure with new, vinyl windows that match the placement and size of the existing windows with the windows on the front façade also matching the mullion style of the front façade's existing windows as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

IV. OLD BUSINESS

None

V. OTHER BUSINESS

HDC Local Standards Review – New Construction, Porches and Decks – Commissioners agreed to review the local standards for New Construction and Porches & Decks in preparation for this meeting. The revised local standards for Residing & Trim Cladding and Roofing incorporating comments from the December meeting will be voted on as well.

March 2019 HDC Training Opportunities – The National Alliance of Preservation Commissions will be offering free, all-day commission training on two upcoming dates. The first opportunity will be on Friday, March 15th in Ypsilanti, and the second will be on Saturday, March 23rd in Kalamazoo. The same topics will be covered on both dates. Additional information will be available at the meeting.

VI. ADJOURN