

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

February 6, 2018

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: S. Kroes, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, A. Riegler

MEMBERS ABSENT: S. Radtke, excused

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: T. Beebe, Jacks Wholesale Windows for J. Piggee; R. Panozzo, 1641 Jefferson St; K. O'Brien, Wilk and Sons

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of January 10, 2018 was made by J. Hilt, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2018-05 – 164 Catherine Avenue – Windows. Applicant: Joyce Piggee. District: McLaughlin. Current Function: Residential. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to install new white vinyl windows to replace deteriorating wood windows. The dining room windows would be replaced with one 3-lite sliding window and the bedroom window would be replaced with one double hung window. White PVC-coated aluminum capping is proposed to be installed on the outside of the replacement windows.

T. Beebe showed pictures of the current windows, which were in poor condition and could not be opened. He also provided a picture of the proposed replacement windows and explained the process of installing them. K. Panozzo asked if they intended to change the size of the windows. T. Beebe stated that they did not. D. Warren asked if wooden replacement windows were considered. T. Beebe stated that vinyl was more durable and his windows came with a lifetime guarantee. He explained that wooden windows were difficult to find now, although there were wood composites.

A. Riegler arrived at 4:08 p.m.

K. Panozzo asked if replacement of any of the wood around the windows would be necessary. T. Beebe stated that a thin piece of wood would be removed and replaced with vinyl. K. Panozzo asked if he had any windows that more closely matched the look of the current windows. T. Beebe stated that he did, but he was looking at the most economical option for the homeowner. A. Riegler stated that the HDC was tasked with upholding the historic district standards, which discouraged vinyl replacement windows. T. Beebe stated that wooden windows would increase the cost, there would be no major aesthetic difference, and the vinyl windows had more functionality.

A motion that the HDC deny the request to replace the wood dining room and bedroom windows with vinyl as proposed was made by K. Panozzo, supported by D. Warren and approved, with L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye, and S. Kroes voting nay.

A second motion was made by A. Riegler and supported by J. Hilt to approve the installation of vinyl replacement windows as long as they are configured as three side-by-side double hung windows, matching what was currently there within ¼ inch and to approve a vinyl replacement bedroom window as long as the configuration matched what was there. The motion was voted on and unanimously approved, with S. Kroes, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

Case 2018-01 was moved to the end of the agenda, as the applicant was unable to be present.

Case 2018-02 – 1641 Jefferson Street – Railing. Applicant: Ray Panozzo. District: Jefferson. Current Function: Residential. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to install a railing around the second-story porch on the back of the house. The railing will replicate what was once in place on the porch.

A. Riegler asked if that type of railing would be allowed by the building inspector. R. Panozzo stated that he was informed that it would be up to the HDC, as they were replacing exactly what had been there previously.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to install the railing as proposed, as long as the work meets all zoning and building code requirements, and the necessary permits are obtained was made by A. Riegler, supported by D. Warren and unanimously approved, with S. Kroes, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye.

Case 2018-03 – 1163 4th Street – Windows and Garage Door. Applicant: Greg Wilkinson/D. Wilkinson Insurance Agency, Inc. District: Houston. Current Function: Residential. This case was tabled from the January meeting so that the applicant could be present to answer questions. They were seeking approval to replace all windows in the house as well as install a new garage door. The house was damaged in a fire; staff has already approved repairs to damaged siding.

J. Pesch stated that, since the last meeting, the request had been updated. He had approved the request to replace the garage door, as it would match what was formerly there. There would be no other exterior changes other than the windows. The applicant was going to try to restore the existing casement windows, but most of the bottom windows were broken. A. Riegler stated that the house was already vinyl-sided. J. Hilt asked if the replacement windows would be the same size and configuration as the current ones. K. O'Brien affirmed that the new windows would look the same as the old ones.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the damaged windows as proposed with the conditions that 1) the new window size and configuration matches the old ones, 2) the work meets all zoning requirements, and 3) the necessary permits are obtained, was made by J. Hilt, supported by D. Warren and unanimously approved, with S. Kroes, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye.

Case 2018-01 – 1669 Peck – Stairs. Applicant: Steven Radtke. District: Clinton-Peck. Current Function: Residential. The applicant is seeking approval to temporarily cover the deteriorating cement steps with wood. The wood steps are a temporary fix until full restoration of the cement steps can be undertaken. Board members had questions on which portions of the porch would be restored and when the restoration work would take place. Since the applicant was unable to be present to

answer questions, a motion to table this case until the next meeting was made by J. Hilt, supported by D. Warren and unanimously approved, with S. Kroes, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye.

S. Kroes left at 5:00 pm.

OTHER

Case 2017-16 – 189 Strong (Demolition). This house had a fire on August 14, 2017 and received HDC approval for demolition at our September 2017 meeting. The State Historic Preservation Office concurred that the house was not a contributing factor to the district and could be demolished.

Case 2015-10 – 316 W. Webster (Doors). Staff and board members discussed the front doors at Hackley Public Library. The consensus was that the doors had been replaced during renovations without receiving HDC approval. D. Warren stated that she would craft a letter to the library board and bring it to the next meeting.

HDC Officer Elections -- A motion to nominate J. Hilt as Chairperson and S. Radtke as Vice Chair was made by D. Warren, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved, with L. Wood, K. Panozzo, J. Hilt, D. Warren, and A. Riegler voting aye. J. Hilt stated that she would accept the position for the next year, and S. Radtke had previously indicated that he would accept the Vice Chair position.

Standards Review Workshop – J. Pesch had reached out to Amanda Reintjes from the Michigan Historic Preservation Network to invite her to the workshop but she had a prior engagement and could not attend. She did state that she was interested in attending any additional workshops that may fall on another date and mentioned a possible West Michigan regional HDC training opportunity in the near future.

Staff and board members moved to conference room 103 to discuss changes to the historic district standards. J. Pesch stated that he would make the changes to the standards that had been agreed on to date, including removing references to Class A and Class AA districts and reintroducing missing illustrations. He will present the revised standards at the next meeting. Staff and board members will continue to work on updating the standards.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:00 PM.