

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Tuesday, February 7, 2023
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: Conference Room 204, City Hall

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order
- II. Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of January 10, 2023
- III. Old Business
- IV. New Business
 - Case 2023-01 – 511 W. Clay – Accessible Ramp
 - Case 2023-02 – 432 W. Muskegon – Windows
 - Case 2023-03 – 460 W. Clay – Siding, Windows, and Addition
- V. Election of Chair and Vice Chair
- VI. Other Business
 - 1292 Jefferson
 - CRC Attendance Policy
- VII. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

**AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETINGS OF THE CITY OF MUSKEGON
AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES**

To give comment on a live-streamed meeting the city will provide a call-in telephone number to the public to be able to call and give comment. For a public meeting that is not live-streamed, and which a citizen would like to watch and give comment, they must contact the City Clerk’s Office with at least a two-business day notice. The participant will then receive a zoom link which will allow them to watch live and give comment. Contact information is below. For more details, please visit: www.shorelinecity.com

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting with twenty-four (24) hours’ notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or by calling the following: Ann Marie Meisch, MMC, City Clerk at 933 Terrace Street, Muskegon, MI 49440 or by calling 231-724-6705 or emailing clerk@shoreline-city.com

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of January 10, 2023.

III. OLD BUSINESS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS

Case 2023-01 – 511 W. Clay – Accessible Ramp
Applicant: Katherine Jawor/Steve Dahlstrom
District: National Register
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to remove and replace an existing paved walkway to the rear porch with a four-foot-wide by 27-foot-long ADA-compliant ramp finished to match the foundation of the house, and add new stairs to the rear porch in a new location.



View of house from W. Clay Avenue, looking east. Rear porch visible at right.



View of reach porch from the rear of the house noting the proposed ramp and stair location.



Proposed finish materials of ramp

Standards

PORCH AND DECK STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES (Abbreviated)

Freestanding or Attached Decks (Uncovered Porches)

Placement and design of all decks shall be approved by the Commission. Decks should be located in unobtrusive locations and shall feature one of the edge details featured on the attached decking detail illustration. Decking boards shall consist of 5/4" thick pressure treated decking or square edged fir decking and appropriately finished. In some cases, composite decking materials may be permitted for use on uncovered porches.

Handrails and Guardrails

Existing original handrails and guardrails shall not be removed without the approval of the Commission. Deteriorated rails shall be repaired as a first course of action. When replacement is necessary, the original details shall be replicated. In cases where height or spacing is required to be modified to meet code requirements, the Commission will carefully review the options to determine the most appropriate method to accomplish this requirement. In cases where handrails or guardrails are new (including those for new decks), the design shall generally conform to the railing and balustrade detail illustrated on the attached sketches.

In all cases, if an original guardrail was higher than the minimum height as listed above, then the original height applies. In general, in order to meet building code requirements, the minimum guardrail height in the historic districts shall conform to the following standards:

PORCH OR DECK FLOOR HEIGHT
FROM FINISHED GROUND GRADE
0" - 30"
≥ 30"

MINIMUM GUARDRAIL HEIGHT
0"
36"

New guardrails on commercial buildings shall conform to the minimum guardrail height for commercial buildings as defined in the most recent edition of the building code.

In all cases, if an original guardrail was higher than the minimum height as listed above, then the original height applies.

...

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to remove and replace an existing paved walkway to the rear porch with a four-foot-wide by 27-foot-long ADA-compliant ramp finished to match the foundation of the house, and add new stairs to the rear porch in a new location as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

Case 2023-02 – 432 W. Muskegon – Windows
Applicant: Tommie and Julie Kittle
District: Houston
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to replace 10 existing windows of varying materials with new vinyl windows. Windows proposed to be replaced include three second floor windows on the east (right) elevation, two second floor windows on the south (front) elevation, three first floor windows and one second floor window on the west (left) elevation, and two first floor windows on the north (rear) elevation.



View of house from W. Muskegon Avenue, looking west. Visible are five second floor windows – two on the south and three on the east elevation – proposed to be replaced.



View from W. Muskegon Avenue, looking north. Visible are four windows on the west elevation to be replaced.

Standards

WINDOW, DOOR, AND EXTERIOR WOODWORK STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES (Abbreviated)

General

These guidelines pertain only to proposed changes to the structure and do not affect existing construction.

These guidelines are primarily directed toward the front and side elevations of the structure. Greater variances and more leniency may be extended toward proposed changes to the rear elevation of the building by the Commission. All desired or proposed changes should be referred to the Historic District Commission for consideration. Extenuating circumstances, the effect upon the architecture of the particular structure together with the general effect upon the surrounding structures, variables in architectural design, or the effect upon usage and viability of the structure could dictate a variance from these guidelines.

No exterior doors, windows, or exterior woodwork shall be altered, removed, relocated, or added without Historic District Commission approval.

Existing exterior window or door casings, sills, and caps shall not be altered from the original design or appearance. Damaged or deteriorated wood shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Damaged or deteriorated wood elements may be replaced or covered with formed aluminum or vinyl, subject to Commission approval and provided that the original profile of the woodwork is not altered or changed.

Primary Windows

Existing damaged or deteriorating window frames and sash shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Metal or vinyl replacement windows may be acceptable provided they match the original windows in design and type and that they consist of or are painted an appropriate color. Bare metal finishes generally will not be acceptable.

The size of glass lites and muntin arrangements shall not be altered without Commission approval. Special glazing, such as stained or leaded art glass, shall not be removed without Commission approval. Unusual decorative windows such as Palladian windows, oriels, bays, Gothic arch or segment tops, etc. shall not be removed or altered.

Storm Windows

Wood storm and screen windows are the most appropriate for use in the historic district. Other types of storm, screen, or combination windows will be approved provided that the new storm window mullions align with the mullions of the primary windows. Blind stop storm and screen windows (where such windows are placed inside the existing window frames rather than affixed to the exterior of the frames) are preferable and may be required in some instances. Bare metal storm and screen windows must be painted to match or complement the trim. Interior storm windows may be acceptable as long as they do not detract from the appearance of the primary windows. Care should be taken, however, when using interior storm windows because condensation tends to form on the inside surface of the primary window and could cause damage to the wood and paint if not properly ventilated.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to replace three second floor windows on the east elevation, two second floor windows on the south elevation, three first floor windows and one second floor window on the west elevation, and two first floor windows on the north elevation with new vinyl windows as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

Case 2023-03 – 460 W. Clay – Siding, Windows, and Addition
Applicant: Nick Schippers
District: Clay-Western
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to install vinyl siding with a 4.5” exposure, install vinyl replacement windows, and replace the cellar door with a small building addition to serve as a basement entryway. Drawings will be provided prior to the meeting.



View of house from W. Clay Avenue, looking west.



View of east elevation of house. Current cellar door visible in lower left (covered in snow).

Standards

See Window, Door, and Exterior Woodwork Standards and Guidelines in Case 2023-02, above.

RESIDING AND TRIM CLADDING GUIDELINES

General

The Muskegon Historic District Commission does not endorse the residing of structures within the Historic districts. It is the policy of this Commission that the original fabric of the building should be repaired or replaced where necessary with the original building material.

In cases where the repair or replacement with like materials is impractical or where it can be demonstrated that the original materials will no longer hold paint or that the original materials are so badly deteriorated that they can no longer be reasonably repaired, the residing standards below shall strictly be adhered to.

Definitions

For the purpose of this statement, the terms “residing materials” and “trim cladding” shall be understood to encompass the use of any residing materials such as aluminum, vinyl, steel, hardboard, wood, masonry, or molded urethane which is designed to replace or cover all, or any part, of an exterior wall, trim work or other building element or a structure within a designated historic district.

Purpose

The Commission shall review all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness proposing the installation of residing materials or trim cladding as individual cases. Each application shall be decided on its own merit. No person should interpret any Commission approval for residing or trim cladding as being precedent setting. Unrestricted use of residing materials or trim cladding will not be allowed.

In any case where residing materials or trim cladding are proposed for use by a property owner or siding contractor, the property owner shall be required to submit a signed letter stating in detail the intent and scope of the proposed residing or trim cladding installation. Such a letter is to also include the identification of any deterioration or problems occurring relative to the existing siding or exterior building fabric. If known, the cause and extent of this deterioration must be clearly stated.

The following conditions of installation shall be met by all proposals for residing or trim cladding:

1. All existing deterioration shall be made structurally sound and its causes, insofar as possible, shall be corrected prior to the installation of residing materials or trim cladding.
2. Any installation of residing materials shall simulate the appearance of the original building material that it is intended to cover. This simulation shall take into account the size, shape or profile, texture, and linear direction of the original building material.
 - a. The residing material shall be similar in appearance and dimension to the original siding. The exposure to the weather of the new siding shall range within one inch of the nominal dimension of the original siding. The Historic District Commission shall have the authority to waive this requirement in the event that they believe a different design or dimension siding would be more appropriate to the architectural character of the Historic District.
 - b. A proposed color shall be appropriate as determined by the Commission.
 - c. Generally, wood grain textures are not approved by the Commission. However, the appropriateness of a specific siding texture shall be determined on an individual case basis.
3. Any installation of trim cladding shall adhere to the following guidelines for the treatment for architectural trim elements.
 - a. Existing cornice or building trim elements shall not be covered or replaced without Commission approval. Commission approval will depend upon how closely the trim cladding or new trim elements duplicate the appearance of the existing building trim elements.
 - b. The wall siding material shall not extend over the existing trim members such as window and door trim, sills, facias, soffits, frieze members and boards, brackets, aprons, corner boards, trim boards, skirt boards, or any other characteristic moldings or architectural features.
 - c. If the above mentioned trim members are to be clad, they shall be covered with custom formed cladding which shall closely approximate the shapes and contours of the existing moldings or trim. Distinctive or unusual trim or architectural elements shall not be clad without prior consideration and Commission approval.

- d. No building trim elements or architectural features are to be removed or altered to facilitate the installation of the new siding or trim cladding without approval of the Historic District Commission.

In most cases the soffit cladding material shall run parallel and not perpendicular to the plane of the wall.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to install vinyl siding with a 4.5” exposure, install vinyl replacement windows, and replace the cellar door with a small building addition to serve as a basement entryway as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

V. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

1292 Jefferson – Staff will provide an update on the Nelson House.

CRC Attendance Policy – The City of Muskegon Community Relations Committee (CRC) has updated the attendance policy for the City’s boards, commissions, and committees. Staff will review the new policy with the HDC.

VII. ADJOURN