

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

May 2, 2023

Vice Chairperson D. Gregersen called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Huss, D. Gregersen, K. George, G. Borgman

MEMBERS ABSENT: S. Radtke, excused; T. Emory, excused

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, W. Webster

OTHERS PRESENT: S. Fowler and N. Schippers (460 W. Clay); A. Figueroa (100 Diana); A. Duren (1624 Jefferson)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of March 7, 2023 and the special meeting minutes of April 17, 2023 was made by J. Huss, supported by K. George and approved with J. Huss, G. Borgman, K. George, and D. Gregersen voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

Case 2023-03 – 460 W. Clay Ave. – Windows

Applicant: Nick Schippers - District: Clay-Western - Current Function: Residential (vacant)

The applicant was seeking approval to remove and replace nine windows on the front elevation with new aluminum-clad wood windows of the same size and configuration, repairing and retaining the colored glass as inserts to be placed on the interior of the upper pane of the replacement windows. J. Pesch explained that in February 2023, the HDC approved installation of “fiberglass or wood replacement windows of the same size and appearance and within the original openings on the side and rear elevations retaining the decorative stained glass windows on the front elevation”, but the property owner had since determined that the larger front windows would not be stable if made from fiberglass, so aluminum-clad wood windows were now being proposed. Staff determined that, due to the unique approach to retaining the colored glass, formal HDC review of the work was necessary.

S. Fowler explained that the existing windows would be disassembled and the stained glass would be reconstructed as a leaded glass panel and held in place on the inside of the new window with clips to provide the same appearance from the outside as the existing windows. He added that a benefit of this method was that all nine of these windows could be removed from the inside to be cleaned.

K. George asked if the stained glass would all be in the same configuration as what was existing and S. Fowler and N. Schippers confirmed that it would be, but that instead of the wood dividers, the pieces of glass would be separated by leaded rails of the same width. G. Borgman asked why the stained glass panel could not be recreated and reinstalled in the upper pane of each window. S. Fowler explained that doing so would not allow for insulated glass. K. George stated that the proposal for the neighboring house (with very similar windows) had planned to use storm windows to protect the stained glass, but that what was being proposed now was a good solution that would generally look the same.

D. Gregersen asked whether the vertical mullion in the middle of one picture window was original. The board agreed that it may not be original since the other picture window did not contain one, and noted that it was not

proposed for the new windows. He also asked if the window would be tinted, as that would affect the view of the proposed stained glass panel. S. Fowler confirmed that the glass would be clear.

N. Schippers mentioned that condensers would be installed on the west side of the house between the two gas meters, but he was unsure of the appropriate means of screening them. J. Pesch shared the HDC's local standards for outdoor appliances. The board debated whether or not a fence or shrubbery would be most appropriate, ultimately deciding that landscaping in the form of shrubs was preferable, and that staff could approve such work if it required review.

N. Schippers informed the board that the previous request to construct a new entry to the basement would not be happening because the house was located too close to the east property line.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to remove and replace nine windows on the front elevation with new aluminum-clad wood windows with clear glass of the same size and configuration repairing and retaining the colored glass as inserts with leaded glass of the same configuration and dimension as the current wood windows to be placed inside the upper pane of the replacement windows. Additionally, the large second floor window will not have a mullion on the lower pane as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by J. Huss, supported by G. Borgman and approved with K. George, J. Huss, G. Borgman, and D. Gregersen voting aye.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2023-08 – 100 Diana Ave. – Garage Demolition and Construction of Two New Garages

Applicant: Antonio Figueroa - District: McLaughlin - Current Function: Residential

The applicant was seeking approval to demolish the existing, detached garage located on the east side of the house and to construct a new, 14'x24' one stall detached garage in its place. An additional 28'x28' two stall detached garage was also proposed on the west side of the house. J. Pesch also shared the proposed exterior materials to be used on the garage which included composite siding with an 8" exposure to match the house.

A. Figueroa explained that the replacement garage would match the one it was replacing, but sited approximately eight feet farther north (toward the back of the property) because of concerns with water from the existing garage roof draining too close to the house. He shared a few examples of garages with dormers that had inspired the design of the new garage on the west side of the house. K. George stated that a roof with dormers was not appropriate for the style of the house. D. Gregersen asked if the goal was to have loft space in the garage and A. Figueroa stated that it was. G. Borgman asked what the appropriate style would be for an Italianate house and D. Gregersen stated that a hip roof would be more appropriate than the gable roof being proposed. J. Pesch shared an example of another newly constructed garage built with a hip roof for the Italianate house at 4th Street and Monroe Avenue in the Houston Historic District. K. George mentioned that the garage could be built with nine-foot-tall walls to leave additional space for storage.

D. Gregersen added that a simple frieze board at the top of the wall could reflect that which is used on the house but with less detail. The HDC discussed the board and batten siding proposed for the front wall of the two-stall garage, and decided that it would be more appropriate to match the siding to house instead. K. George recommended that staff be provided an updated elevation drawing and site plan prior to final approval.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to demolish the existing, detached garage located on the east side of the house and to construct a new, 14'x24' one stall detached garage of the same appearance in a location just north of the demolished garage as well as construct an additional 28'x28' two stall detached garage with a hipped roof on the west side of the house, both with 1"x8" composite siding with the HDC staff liaison providing final approval upon submission of a site plan and elevation drawings as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by J. Huss, supported by K. George and approved with K. George, J. Huss, G. Borgman, and D. Gregersen voting aye.

OTHER BUSINESS

2023 Staff Approval Update #1 – Since the last update in January 2023, Staff had approved eight projects, those bolded were discussed with the HDC chairperson prior to approval:

- 504 W. Clay – Re-roof house
- 1597 Peck – Re-roof house
- 1065 4th – Re-roof flat roof
- 469 W. Webster – Replacement of four double hung windows with new windows of the same size, design, proportions, profile, and materials
- **1197 Terrace – Replace remaining wood windows with vinyl windows of the same size and configuration and side the gable end of the front porch (lead paint remediation)**
- **511 W. Clay – Enlarge existing 32”-wide door to 36”-wide of the same style and material on the rear porch, west elevation**
- **458 W. Webster – Installation of a 5” half-round copper gutter segment with hanging straps and a 3” corrugated round downspout (on the west elevation of the house to allow water to drain away from the foundation)**
- **1163 4th – Replace four fire-damaged windows with vinyl windows of the same style**

1624 Jefferson – A. Duren attended the meeting to discuss potentially removing gutters from his house. He explained that he recently had his roof replaced and there was a leak in the bathroom that he thought could have been tied to the new roof. Speaking with the contractor, he was told that the wood soffit was rotting and would need to be replaced with aluminum to avoid further rot; this work would require removing the gutters and not re-using them.

The board discussed possible issues that may exist or problems that might have occurred with the work and advised A. Duren to get a second opinion on the work. Board members agreed that whatever solution is presented, staff could approve the work instead of reviewing the work at another meeting.

HDC Public Outreach – The board agreed to discuss this topic in more detail at a future meeting.

ADJOURN

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:36 p.m.