

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

July 6, 2021

Chairperson S. Radtke called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: T. Emory, A. Riegler, K. George, S. Radtke

MEMBERS ABSENT: D. Gregersen

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, C. Cashin

OTHERS PRESENT: C. O'Brien (D. Wilkinson Insurance Agency, Inc.), 72 E. Grand

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of June 1, 2021 was made by T. Emory, supported by A. Riegler and approved with A. Riegler, S. Radtke and T. Emory voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2021-25 – 1392 5th – Porch Skirting

Applicant: Kimi George - District: Campus - Current Function: Residential

J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the lattice and 1"x4" framed skirting with 1"x6" framed slatted skirting with 1"x4" slats.

The HDC had a short discussion about the material of the new porch skirting. K. George verified that the material would be wood.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the lattice and 1"x4" framed skirting with 1"x6" framed slatted skirting with 1"x4" slats as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by T. Emory and approved, with A. Riegler, S. Radtke and T. Emory voting aye and K. George abstaining.

A. Riegler left at 4:05pm.

Case 2021-26 – 72 E. Grand – Windows, Doors and Siding

Applicant: D. Wilkinson Insurance Agency, Inc. - District: Clinton-Peck - Current Function: Residential

J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to 1) remove and replace 12 wood windows on the first floor with double hung vinyl windows of the same sizes (except where a picture window is required on the front porch), 2) remove one wood window on the first floor's east elevation and install a new vinyl egress window in a new location on the same wall, 3) remove and replace four wood windows on the second floor with double hung vinyl windows of the same sizes except for one existing, non-original window on the south elevation to be replaced with a new egress window (above the porch), 4) reside the entire house with

vinyl siding, retaining the existing brick and corbels, 5) remove the door on the north elevation and install siding over the opening, 6) replace two remaining, non-original exterior doors with six panel doors matching the existing front door, 7) reverse the door swing on the west elevation, and 8) replace counterflashing and other required repairs on the roof (unfinished from former owner's permit).

The HDC had a discussion with the property owner, C. O'Brien, regarding each item listed above. C. O'Brien stated that they were trying to renovate this home to make it an affordable resale property. S. Radtke informed the owner that the standards generally require that replacement windows match the style, design, and material of the original windows. The HDC informed the homeowner that they would like to see windows with similar mullion patterns. K. George suggested that the owner research other window options and provide the HDC or staff with options that more closely match the existing windows. The HDC discussed allowing double hung windows on the less-visible sides of the home, but requiring similar mullion patterns on the two sides of the home that are most visible from the street.

J. Pesch explained the difference between the current and proposed locations of the kitchen window. The HDC did not have any comments.

J. Pesch said the second-floor window on the front of the house, above the porch, was not original and had existed since at least the 1980s; he was not sure what the window would have looked like originally. The homeowner mentioned that the proposed window would be a 36"x40" casement window, slightly larger than the existing double hung window. The HDC was concerned that a large, single-pane casement window without mullions would look like a blank square on the facade. They requested that vertical mullions be applied to the window to make its appearance more compatible with other windows in the house.

C. O'Brien discussed the current condition of the siding on the home which was missing or damaged in several areas. The HDC discussed their willingness to allow vinyl siding for this home if the new siding profile matched the existing siding's profile, and if trim and corner boards were replaced with boards of smooth wood or a material similar to wood of the same dimensions. C. O'Brien stated that they would leave the rafters on the dormer exposed. K. George requested that the pediment over the front porch be retained and painted rather than sided.

C. O'Brien discussed the layout of the rear door that they proposed to remove and side over. The door opened onto a staircase leading to the basement. S. Radtke was concerned about how the foundation would be installed to close in the gap for the doorway if it were removed. J. Pesch stated that the home already had significant repairs made to its foundation and that the location of this patch would not be visible from the street.

S. Radtke suggested that the front door be replaced with something more appropriate to the style of the house than the six-panel steel door.

The HDC did not have concerns about reversing the door swing on the west elevation.

C. O'Brien asked if siding could be added to the deck on the west elevation. The HDC suggested that a solid wall railing be used and that vinyl siding matching the body of the house be installed from the ground to the top of the railing.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to remove and replace a total of four wood windows on the north and east elevations of the house including the wood kitchen window near the rear of the west elevation of the house with double hung vinyl windows of the same sizes; replace 11 wood windows on the south and west elevations of the house with vinyl windows of the same size, configuration, and vertical mullion patterns permanently affixed to both the interior and the exterior of the windows and similar in appearance to those of the existing wood windows; replace the non-original, second-floor window on the south elevation with a vinyl

egress window with a vertical mullion pattern in a style similar to the 11 windows with vertical mullions; remove one wood window on the first floor's east elevation, side over the opening, and install a new vinyl egress window in a new location three feet from the rear of the house on the same wall; remove the existing wood lap siding and replace it with vinyl siding with the conditions that the vinyl siding reveal match the dimensions of the existing wood lap siding as closely as possible, that the existing brick, corbels, and the pediment over the front porch are retained, and that all wooden corners and trim be repaired where possible or, if necessary, replaced with similar materials of the same dimensions and with a smooth finish; remove the door on the north elevation and install vinyl siding over the opening; replace two remaining, non-original exterior doors with six panel doors matching the existing front door, reversing the door swing on the west elevation, and with the recommendation that the front door instead be replaced with a 1/4-lite craftsman-style door. Approval is granted under the assumption that the work will meet all zoning requirements and that the necessary permits are obtained, was made by K. George, supported by T. Emory and unanimously approved, with T. Emory, K. George, and S. Radtke voting aye.

OTHER BUSINESS

2021 Staff Approval Update #2 – Since the last update in April, Staff had approved 19 projects, those **bolded** were discussed with the HDC Chairperson prior to approval:

- 263 W. Muskegon – Replacement of wood stair treads and one exterior door
- 504 W. Clay – Replacement of rotted porch floor and railings with matching materials
- 401 W. Western – Restoration of marquee and sign (items that did not require full HDC review)
- 404 W. Webster – Paving of existing gravel driveway
- 59 Irwin – Replacement of fixed pane bathroom window, replace living room window with matching window or repair broken glass pane
- 1727 Jefferson – Installation of 18' of 6'-tall wood privacy fence
- **308 Monroe – Installation of above-ground pool (16' diameter, 4' depth) and 6'-tall vinyl privacy fence**
- 349 Houston – 6'-tall vinyl privacy fence
- 1542 Clinton – Replacement of damaged exterior door with matching door
- 299 Houston – Replacement of remaining porch flooring (item did not require full HDC review)
- 294 Monroe – Installation of 6'-tall vinyl privacy fence and 4'-tall vinyl picket fence
- **511 W. Clay – Residing of garage to match house**
- 1624 Jefferson – Reroof house
- **458 W. Webster – Repair and replace porch roof. Reinstall decorative second-story exterior railing**
- 1261 Ransom – Installation of 3'-tall wood picket fence
- 424 W. Webster – Reroof house
- 32 Diana – Installation of 6'-tall wood privacy fence and 4'-tall wood picket fence
- 153 Campus – Reroof house
- 1368 5th – Reroof house

Staff Approval of Sheds – Past discussions of the HDC involved enabling Staff to approve requests for new sheds should they meet certain standards. Staff had drafted the following general design standards based on recent conditions of approval used by the HDC and was seeking consent to add them to the Staff Approval Form: *Sheds must have seven-foot-tall walls, a gable roof with a minimum of a 6/12 pitch, and double doors with each door being 3'-6" wide. Sheds shall be as neutral as possible and shall not be a focal point of the property. All sheds must receive a Development Permit prior to construction and must follow the requirements of the City of Muskegon Zoning Ordinance.*

No action was taken at this time.

State Historic Tax Credit Program - Draft Rules Public Comment – The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) released the draft rules for the recently renewed State Historic Preservation Tax Credit program for public comment. Comments must be received not later than 5:00p.m., Friday, July 30, 2021.

Identification of Historic Resources – As part of the HDC goal setting discussion that took place earlier in the year, Staff is requesting that Commissioners assist in informally identifying resources with particular historic significance to the Muskegon community. These could be sites, structures, or areas located in the city of Muskegon and located outside or within a local historic district that could be compiled into a list and/or map. That would then aid in identifying potential expansions to existing historic districts, planning for future historic districts, or informing possible nominations of resources to the National Register of Historic Places. Staff intends to present the Commission's findings, adding any information readily available on each, and review them in further detail at the next HDC meeting.

ADJOURN

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

CC