

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

August 7, 2018

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, D. Warren, S. Kroes

MEMBERS ABSENT: K. Panozzo, excused

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: C. Kotchka, City of Muskegon Community & Neighborhood Services Department (CNS)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of July 11, 2018 was made by J. Hilt, supported by S. Radtke and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2018-23 – 1179 4th Street (Vinyl siding). Applicant: City of Muskegon CNS Department. District: Houston. Current Function: Residential. The applicant is seeking approval to install vinyl siding on the house. C. Kotchka stated that the City's CNS Department was assisting the homeowner with purchasing and installing the vinyl siding through a HUD grant; assistance with painting was not available through that program. She had requested SHPO approval for the work, as she did with all requests. SHPO approved the work, stating that the house was not included or eligible for inclusion in the National Register. J. Pesch stated that he thought this was one of the last houses on this block to have wood siding. S. Radtke noted that the house appeared to have multiple layers of siding, meaning the windows would probably be recessed once another layer was added. A. Riegler asked about the new-looking section of wood siding on the house. C. Kotchka stated that a chimney had been removed and the holes were repaired with the new wood siding in that spot. A. Riegler stated that, considering that no assistance with painting was available and all other houses on the block had vinyl siding, she would consider approving the request.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to install vinyl siding on the house as long as the necessary permits are obtained, was made by S. Radtke, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

S. Radtke suggested HUD be contacted to ask about the possibility of providing painting assistance in addition to vinyl siding, and asked who would do that. J. Pesch stated that he would talk to the Director of the CNS Department about it. The HUD grants were awarded based on income. The board discussed how to handle vinyl siding requests, considering that so many had been approved in the past. Board members concurred that they preferred to see wood siding retained rather than continue to approve its replacement.

Case 2018-25 – 458 W. Webster Avenue (Garage Rehabilitation). Applicant: Jonathan and Katelyn Gress. District: National Register. Current Function: Residential. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to do extensive rehab work to the garage, including 1) completely removing and rebuilding the rear garage wall facing the alley with reinforced CMU block finished with a stucco cement product to match the rest of the structure. 2) installing new windows of a similar size, configuration, and mullion design to replace the deteriorated or missing windows, 3) installing new carriage house-style garage doors to replace existing deteriorating and non-functioning doors, 4) adding an entry door to allow for better egress as well as

an additional upstairs window, and 5) adding new veneer stone lintels over windows. The existing wall is constructed of unreinforced clay masonry block covered with a stucco cement finish, and it sustained extensive damage from falling snow and subsequent freeze/thaw cycles last winter. The awning that had been attached above the garage doors was ripped off, damaging several courses of the block it was attached to; full wall replacement was determined to be safer than shoring and replacing individual blocks.

Staff and board members discussed the historic importance of this home. S. Radtke stated that he would like to see more information on what was under the ivy covering much of the building, as it wasn't possible to see the window configurations or spacing. Board members concurred that more information was needed.

A motion that the HDC table this request until more information was obtained including the materials to be used, and a drawing of the current configuration of the garage windows and other openings was provided, was made by J. Hilt, supported by S. Radtke and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

Case 2018-26 – 477 W. Western Avenue (Sign). Applicant: Bernie Wade (Advanced Signs). District: National Register. Current Function: Residential. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to install a custom fabricated, double-sided projecting sign on the corner of the building. The proposed sign is approximately 48" tall x 46" wide, and will be attached 15 feet above grade. It will be internally illuminated and have exposed red neon letters. He provided renderings of the sign to the board showing the sign detail and where it was to be placed on the building.

D. Warren asked how the sign would be affixed to the building. The specs showed a bracket and bolts. J. Pesch stated that, although the standards stated that no neon was allowed, it seemed appropriate, and was used in this area. A. Riegler stated that she didn't see a problem with it, considering the board was working on updating the standards anyway. J. Pesch stated that the Secretary of the Interior standards had no rules for signs.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to install the proposed 48" x 46" custom fabricated, double-sided projecting sign, with internally illuminated/exposed red neon letters 15 feet above grade on the corner of the building as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

Three walk-on cases were also heard:

Case 2018-27 (Walk-on) – 1116 Terrace Street (Fence). Applicant: Louse Herman. District: McLaughlin. Current Function: Residential. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the existing, deteriorating picket fence with a new style picket fence. The work had already been completed.

J. Hilt suggested that the applicant be notified by letter that any future work done without first obtaining HDC approval would have to be dismantled. Board members discussed the appearance of the new fence and the standards, and concurred that the fence should be painted.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the existing picket fence with the new style picket fence with the conditions that the new wood fence must be painted within one year of installation, the work meets all zoning requirements, and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by L. Wood, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

Case 2018-28 (Walk-on) – 1197 Terrace Street (Fence). Applicant: Ty Ross. District: McLaughlin. Current Function: Residential. The applicant is requesting approval to build a 6-foot tall wood privacy fence as an extension of the existing fence on the property. The work has already been completed.

J. Pesch provided a picture of the fence, which extended between the house and the south property line. A motion that the HDC approve the request to extend the 6' tall privacy fence to the south property line as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, and with the condition that the new wood fence must be painted within one year of installation, was made by A. Riegler, supported by D. Warren and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

S. Kroes arrived at 4:40 PM.

Case 2018-29 (Walk-on) – 1100 3rd Street (Sign). Applicant: Phyllis Watson-Loudermill. District: Houston. Current function: Commercial. The applicant is requesting approval to install one (1) refurbished, non-lit aluminum ground sign at the property. The sign would be located along the 3rd Street frontage. Staff and board members discussed the renderings of the sign that were provided by J. Pesch and concurred that the sign was too large and was not compatible with the scale of the building. J. Pesch also stated that the sign did not comply with zoning regulations.

A motion that the HDC deny the request to install a refurbished, non-lit aluminum sign as presented in the application, was made by D. Warren, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, D. Warren, and S. Kroes voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

None

OTHER

Case 2018-24 – 185 Strong – Demolition (Shed) – The shed at this property had a fire on July 17, 2018. Staff met with the owner and determined that the shed was added to the property recently, and was not historically or architecturally significant. As staff cannot approve demolitions, approval was granted by HDC Chairperson, Jackie Hilt.

HDC Local Standards Review – Signage. A. Riegler asked that staff provide a copy of the full HDC signage policy to all board members so they could review them and note any changes they'd like to see. D. Warren suggested that language be included to notify applicants that the board's decisions would be based on the updated standards and that they would not necessarily have to consider work that had been approved prior to the new standards being enacted. Board members decided to schedule a work session to discuss and review the signage policy a half-hour prior to the September HDC meeting.

Walk-on HDC applications. The board discussed whether to continue allowing walk-on applications, since there had been a number of them recently. A. Riegler suggested that the board no longer accept walk-on applications until such time that the standards were updated. Board members concurred.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:15 PM.