

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Tuesday, September 6, 2022
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: Conference Room 204, City Hall

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order
- II. Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of July 12, 2022.
- III. Old Business
 - Case 2022-29 – 1586 Peck – Siding and Trim Cladding
- IV. New Business
 - Case 2022-30 – 116 E. Isabella – Siding and Windows
 - Case 2022-31 – 1541 Clinton – Windows
- V. Other Business
 - Election of Vice Chairperson
 - CLG Application Update
- VI. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETING OF THE CITY COMMISSION AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting, upon twenty-four hour notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or calling the following: Ann Marie Cummings, City Clerk at 933 Terrace Street, Muskegon, MI 49440 or by calling (231) 724-6705 or TTY/TDD: Dial 7-1-1 and request that representative dial 231-724-6705

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of July 12, 2022.

III. OLD BUSINESS

Case 2022-29 – 1586 Peck – Siding and Trim Cladding
Applicant: Danny Rodas
District: Clinton-Peck
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to install vinyl siding and trim and wrap the columns on the house's porches to make them square rather than round. This is a continuation of the discussion started at the July meeting where the HDC approved the request to replace all windows with vinyl replacement windows matching the size, shape, and appearance of the original windows and with the condition that all leaded glass windows are retained.



View of west (front) and south elevations from Peck Street, looking northeast. Unapproved replacement windows visible on first-story.



View of north and west elevations from Peck Street. Unapproved replacement window visible on front porch.

Standards

RESIDING AND TRIM CLADDING GUIDELINES

General

The Muskegon Historic District Commission does not endorse the residing of structures within the Historic districts. It is the policy of this Commission that the original fabric of the building should be repaired or replaced where necessary with the original building material.

In cases where the repair or replacement with like materials is impractical or where it can be demonstrated that the original materials will no longer hold paint or that the original materials are so badly deteriorated that they can no longer be reasonably repaired, the residing standards below shall strictly be adhered to.

Definitions

For the purpose of this statement, the terms “residing materials” and “trim cladding” shall be understood to encompass the use of any residing materials such as aluminum, vinyl, steel, hardboard, wood, masonry, or molded urethane which is designed to replace or cover all, or any part, of an exterior wall, trim work or other building element or a structure within a designated historic district.

Purpose

The Commission shall review all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness proposing the installation of residing materials or trim cladding as individual cases. Each application shall be decided on its own merit. No person should interpret any Commission approval for residing or trim

cladding as being precedent setting. Unrestricted use of residing materials or trim cladding will not be allowed.

In any case where residing materials or trim cladding are proposed for use by a property owner or siding contractor, the property owner shall be required to submit a signed letter stating in detail the intent and scope of the proposed residing or trim cladding installation. Such a letter is to also include the identification of any deterioration or problems occurring relative to the existing siding or exterior building fabric. If known, the cause and extent of this deterioration must be clearly stated.

The following conditions of installation shall be met by all proposals for residing or trim cladding:

1. All existing deterioration shall be made structurally sound and its causes, insofar as possible, shall be corrected prior to the installation of residing materials or trim cladding.
2. Any installation of residing materials shall simulate the appearance of the original building material that it is intended to cover. This simulation shall take into account the size, shape or profile, texture, and linear direction of the original building material.
 - a. The residing material shall be similar in appearance and dimension to the original siding. The exposure to the weather of the new siding shall range within one inch of the nominal dimension of the original siding. The Historic District Commission shall have the authority to waive this requirement in the event that they believe a different design or dimension siding would be more appropriate to the architectural character of the Historic District.
 - b. A proposed color shall be appropriate as determined by the Commission.
 - c. Generally, wood grain textures are not approved by the Commission. However, the appropriateness of a specific siding texture shall be determined on an individual case basis.
3. Any installation of trim cladding shall adhere to the following guidelines for the treatment for architectural trim elements.
 - a. Existing cornice or building trim elements shall not be covered or replaced without Commission approval. Commission approval will depend upon how closely the trim cladding or new trim elements duplicate the appearance of the existing building trim elements.
 - b. The wall siding material shall not extend over the existing trim members such as window and door trim, sills, facias, soffits, frieze members and boards, brackets, aprons, corner boards, trim boards, skirt boards, or any other characteristic moldings or architectural features.
 - c. If the above mentioned trim members are to be clad, they shall be covered with custom formed cladding which shall closely approximate the shapes and contours of the existing moldings or trim. Distinctive or unusual trim or architectural elements shall not be clad without prior consideration and Commission approval.
 - d. No building trim elements or architectural features are to be removed or altered to facilitate the installation of the new siding or trim cladding without approval of the Historic District Commission.

In most cases the soffit cladding material shall run parallel and not perpendicular to the plane of the wall.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to install vinyl siding and trim, and wrap the columns on the house's porches as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

Case 2022-30 – 116 E. Isabella – Siding and Windows
Applicant: City of Muskegon Community and Neighborhood Services (CNS)
District: McLaughlin
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to install vinyl siding with the same exposure dimension as the original siding and a smooth finish, and to remove and replace 17 existing wood windows with new windows of the same size, design, proportions, profile, and materials.



View of south and east elevations of house from E. Isabella Avenue, looking west.



View of west and south elevations of house from E. Isabella Avenue, looking north.

Standards

WINDOW, DOOR, AND EXTERIOR WOODWORK STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES (Abbreviated)

General

These guidelines pertain only to proposed changes to the structure and do not affect existing construction.

These guidelines are primarily directed toward the front and side elevations of the structure. Greater variances and more leniency may be extended toward proposed changes to the rear elevation of the building by the Commission. All desired or proposed changes should be referred to the Historic District Commission for consideration. Extenuating circumstances, the effect upon the architecture of the particular structure together with the general effect upon the surrounding structures, variables in architectural design, or the effect upon usage and viability of the structure could dictate a variance from these guidelines.

No exterior doors, windows, or exterior woodwork shall be altered, removed, relocated, or added without Historic District Commission approval.

...

Primary Windows

Existing damaged or deteriorating window frames and sash shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Metal or vinyl replacement windows may be acceptable provided they match the original windows in design and type and that they consist of or are painted an appropriate color. Bare metal finishes generally will not be acceptable.

The size of glass lites and muntin arrangements shall not be altered without Commission approval. Special glazing, such as stained or leaded art glass, shall not be removed without Commission approval. Unusual decorative windows such as Palladian windows, oriels, bays, Gothic arch or segment tops, etc. shall not be removed or altered.

Also see Residing and Trim Cladding Guidelines in Case 2022-29, above.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to install vinyl siding with the same exposure dimension as the original siding and a smooth finish, and to remove and replace 17 existing wood windows with new windows of the same size, design, proportions, profile, and materials as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

Case 2022-31 – 1541 Clinton – Windows
Applicant: Dan Rikkers
District: Clinton-Peck
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to replace a total of nine wood windows with eight wood or vinyl replacement windows of the same size, design, proportions, and profile except for a pair of adjacent double-hung windows on the first-story of the north elevation which would be replaced with a single window filling the windows' original openings. Some of the original windows have been missing for a number of years.



View of south and east (front) elevations from Clinton Street. Two second-story, double-hung windows on front elevation are proposed to be replaced.



View of west (rear) and south elevations from E. Southern Avenue. Boarded-up first-story window is missing and proposed to be replaced. Two double-hung windows and one picture window on the second-story south elevation is proposed to be replaced.



View of east and north elevations from Clinton Street. Larger second-story window on north elevation (currently only a storm window) is proposed to be replaced. The pair of adjacent, first-story windows on the north elevation are proposed to be replaced with a single window filling the windows' original openings.

Standards

See Window, Door, and Exterior Woodwork Standards and Guidelines in Case 2022-30, above.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to replace a total of nine wood windows with eight (wood/vinyl) replacement windows of the same size, design, proportions, and profile except for a pair of adjacent double-hung windows on the first-story of the north elevation which would be replaced with a single window filling the windows' original openings as presented in the September 6, 2022 HDC staff report as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Election of Vice Chairperson – The HDC's Vice Chairperson resigned a few months ago and they have not been replaced. Election of a new Vice Chairperson will be considered by the board at this meeting.

CLG Application Update – In early August, Staff submitted Muskegon's application to the Certified Local Government program and is expecting a response as to its status soon. As previously discussed, certification through the program would make Muskegon eligible for annual CLG grant opportunities. Applications for the FY23 grant cycle open October 3, 2022, and at the May meeting, the HDC supported applying for funding to assist with conservation work for the monuments in Hackley Park.

VII. ADJOURN