

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Thursday, October 15, 2020
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: Conference Room 204, City Hall

AGENDA

I. Call to Order

II. New Business

Case 2020-22 – 401 W. Western – Windows

Case 2020-23 – 1522 Clinton – New Construction (Garage)

III. Old Business

IV. Other Business

Resolution Ratifying and Confirming Prior Historic District Commission Approvals

MHPN Historic Resources Directory

V. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETING OF THE CITY COMMISSION AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting, upon twenty-four hour notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or calling the following: Ann Marie Cummings, City Clerk at 933 Terrace Street, Muskegon, MI 49440 or by calling (231) 724-6705 or TTY/TDD: Dial 7-1-1 and request that representative dial 231-724-6705

II. NEW BUSINESS

Case 2020-22 – 401 W. Western – Windows

Applicant: Frauenthal Center/Community Foundation for Muskegon County

District: Downtown Structures

Current Function: Commercial

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to replace 102 windows. 57 windows are on the north and west facades of the offices fronting W. Western Avenue and 3rd Street, respectively; 6 small windows are on the 3rd Street side of the building on the upper floors and closer to the alley; 14 windows are in the alley; 3 windows are above the main roofline of the building on the elevator equipment room; 21 windows are in an internal courtyard not visible from the street; 1 window is on the west façade, facing 4th Street. The work has been partially completed.



View of structure from intersection of W. Western Avenue and 3rd Street, six east-facing windows visible at left



View of structure from W. Western Avenue with previous windows visible at right



View of north façade showing design of new and existing windows



View showing three windows in elevator equipment room and one west-facing window



Typical window style currently used in alley

Standards (Abbreviated)

General

These guidelines pertain only to proposed changes to the structure and do not affect existing construction.

These guidelines are primarily directed toward the front and side elevations of the structure. Greater variances and more leniency may be extended toward proposed changes to the rear elevation of the building by the Commission. All desired or proposed changes should be referred to the Historic District Commission for consideration. Extenuating circumstances, the effect upon the architecture of the particular structure together with the general effect upon the surrounding structures, variables in architectural design, or the effect upon usage and viability of the structure could dictate a variance from these guidelines.

No exterior doors, windows, or exterior woodwork shall be altered, removed, relocated, or added without Historic District Commission approval.

Existing exterior window or door casings, sills, and caps shall not be altered from the original design or appearance. Damaged or deteriorated wood shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Damaged or deteriorated wood elements may be replaced or covered with formed aluminum or vinyl, subject to Commission approval and provided that the original profile of the woodwork is not altered or changed.

Primary Windows

Existing damaged or deteriorating window frames and sash shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Metal or vinyl replacement windows may be acceptable provided they match the original windows in design and type and that they consist of or are painted an appropriate color. Bare metal finishes generally will not be acceptable.

The size of glass lites and muntin arrangements shall not be altered without Commission approval. Special glazing, such as stained or leaded art glass, shall not be removed without Commission approval. Unusual decorative windows such as Palladian windows, oriels, bays, Gothic arch or segment tops, etc. shall not be removed or altered.

Storm Windows

Wood storm and screen windows are the most appropriate for use in the historic district. Other types of storm, screen, or combination windows will be approved provided that the new storm window mullions align with the mullions of the primary windows. Blind stop storm and screen windows (where such windows are placed inside the existing window frames rather than affixed to the exterior of the frames) are preferable and may be required in some instances. Bare metal storm and screen windows must be painted to match or complement the trim. Interior storm windows may be acceptable as long as they do not detract from the appearance of the primary windows. Care should be taken, however, when using interior storm windows because condensation tends to form on the inside surface of the primary window and could cause damage to the wood and paint if not properly ventilated.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to replace 102 windows: 57 windows on the north and west facades of the offices fronting W. Western Avenue and 3rd Street; 6 small windows on the 3rd Street side of the building on the upper floors and closer to the alley; 14 windows in the alley; 3 windows above the main roofline of the building on the elevator equipment room; 21 windows in an internal courtyard not visible from the street; and 1 window on the west façade, facing 4th Street as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

Case 2020-23 – 1522 Clinton – New Construction (Garage)
Applicant: Belinda Spray
District: Clinton-Peck
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to construct a new 12' x 20', wood frame, vinyl sided garage in the rear yard of the property accessed from the rear alley. The work has been partially completed.



View of house from side yard, new garage out of view at left



View of new garage from rear yard



Side elevation of garage viewed from rear yard, alley visible at left



View of new garage from rear alley

Standards

New Construction

Recommended

Height - Relating the overall height of new construction to that of adjacent structures. As a general rule, construct new buildings to a height roughly equal to the average height of existing buildings from the historic period on and across the street.

Not Recommended

Height - Introducing new construction that varies greatly in height (too high or too low) from older buildings in the vicinity. Extreme differences in building heights will have a detrimental visual effects on the appearance of surrounding property.

Scale - Relating the size and proportions of new structures to the scale of adjacent buildings. Although a building may be much larger than its neighbors in terms of square footage, it should maintain the same scale and rhythm as the existing buildings.

Massing - Breaking up uninteresting box-like forms into smaller, varied masses such as are common on most buildings from the historic period. Variety of form and massing are elements essential to the character of the streetscape in historic districts. For example, if an infill site is large, the mass of the facade can be broken into a number of small bays.

Directional Expression - Relating the vertical, horizontal, or non-directional facade character of new buildings to the predominant directional expression of nearby buildings. Horizontal buildings can be made to relate to the more vertical adjacent structures by breaking the facade into smaller masses that conform to the primary expression of the streetscape.

Setback - Maintaining the historic facade lines of streetscape by locating front walls of new buildings in the same plane as the facades of adjacent buildings. If exceptions are made, buildings should be set back into the lot rather than closer to the street. If existing setbacks vary, new buildings should conform to historic siting patterns.

Sense of Entry - Articulating the main entrances to the building with covered porches, porticos, and other pronounced architectural forms. Entries were historically raised a few steps above the grade of the property and were a prominent visual feature of the street elevation of the building.

Roof Shapes - Relating the roof forms of the new buildings to those found in the area. Although not entirely necessary, duplication of the existing or traditional roof shapes, pitches, and materials on new construction is one way of making new structures more vis-

Scale - Creating buildings that in height, width, or massing violate the existing scale of the area. The new building should not disrupt the scale and rhythm of the streetscape, although it might be appropriate in a different location.

Massing - Introducing single, monolithic forms that are not relieved by variations in massing. Box-like facades and forms are intrusive when placed in a streetscape of older buildings that have varied massing and facade articulation.

Directional Expression - Creating strongly horizontal or vertical facade expressions unless compatible with the character of structures in the immediate area. A new building that does not relate well to its neighbors or to the rhythm of the streetscape because of an unbroken horizontal facade should be avoided.

Setback - Violating the existing setback pattern by placing a new building in front of or behind the historic facade line. Placing buildings at odd angles to the street, unless in an area where diverse siting already exists, even if property setback is maintained, should be avoided.

Sense of Entry - Introducing facades with no strong sense of entry. Side entries or entries not defined by a porch or similar transitional element result in an incompatible "flat" first-floor facade.

Roof Shapes - Introducing roof shapes, pitches, or materials not traditionally used in the area.

ually compatible.

Rhythm of Openings - Respecting the recurrent alteration of wall areas with door and window elements in the facade. Also considering the width-to-height ratio of bays in the facade. The placement of openings with respect to the facade's overall composition, symmetry or balanced symmetry should be carefully studied.

Design Expression - Composing the materials, textures and colors of the new building facade to compliment adjacent facades and relating details and decorations of the new building to those of existing surrounding buildings.

Imitations - Accurate restoration of or visually compatible additions to existing buildings and former construction, contemporary architecture that well represents our own time yet, enhances the nature and character of the historic district.

Rhythm of Openings - Introducing incompatible facade patterns that upset the rhythm of openings established in surrounding structures. For example, glass walls and window and door shapes and locations which are disrespectful to the adjoining buildings.

Design Expression - Violating the existing character of the district by introducing non-compatible materials, textures, colors, details, and decoration on new buildings.

Imitations - Replicating or imitating the styles, motif, or details of older periods. Such attempts detract from the character of the district by compromising what is truly historic.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to construct a new 12' x 20', wood frame, vinyl sided garage in the rear yard of the property accessed from the rear alley as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

III. OLD BUSINESS

None

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Resolution Ratifying and Confirming Prior Historic District Commission Approvals – Staff is requesting approval of the attached resolution to ratify and confirm, *nunc pro tunc*, all of the Historic District Commission’s actions approved at Historic District Commission meetings held after April 30, 2020, which were conducted remotely via technological means in compliance with the Executive Orders.

MHPN Historic Resources Directory – The Michigan Historic Preservation Network’s Historic Resource Council has provided copies of their Spring 2019 Member Directory. The Directory is published to serve as a resource for individuals and companies in Michigan and surrounding areas looking for preservation professionals. Copies will be distributed to HDC board members.

V. ADJOURN

ATTACHMENT

**RESOLUTION RATIFYING AND CONFIRMING PRIOR
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPROVALS**

CITY OF MUSKEGON
County of Muskegon, State of Michigan

Minutes of a meeting of the Historic District Commission of the City of Muskegon, County of Muskegon, Michigan (the "City"), held on the 15th day of October, 2020 at 5:30 p.m., prevailing Eastern Time.

PRESENT: Members: _____

ABSENT: Members: _____

The following preamble and resolution were offered by Member _____ and supported by Member _____.

WHEREAS, the Historic District Commission has previously approved various actions at Historic District Commission meetings held after April 30, 2020, which were conducted remotely via technological means in compliance with Governor Whitmer's executive orders related to the COVID-19 pandemic (the "Executive Orders"); and

WHEREAS, in a recent opinion issued by the Michigan Supreme Court on October 2, 2020, in the case of *Midwest Institute of Health, PLLC v Whitmer*, the Supreme Court held that the Governor did not have authority to issue executive orders related to the COVID-19 pandemic under either the Emergency Management Act of 1976 or the Emergency Powers of the Governor Act of 1945 after April 30, 2020; and

WHEREAS, the Historic District Commission desires to ratify and confirm, *nunc pro tunc*, its actions approved at Historic District Commission meetings held after April 30, 2020, which were conducted remotely via technological means in compliance with the Executive Orders.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

1. Ratification. The Historic District Commission hereby ratifies and confirms, *nunc pro tunc*, all of the Historic District Commission's actions approved at Historic District Commission meetings held after April 30, 2020, which were conducted remotely via technological means in compliance with the Executive Orders.

RESOLUTION DECLARED ADOPTED.

YEAS: _____

NAYS:

ABSTAIN:

Steven Radtke
Chairperson, Historic District Commission

I hereby certify that the foregoing constitutes a true and complete copy of a resolution adopted by the Historic District Commission of the City of Muskegon, County of Muskegon, State of Michigan, at a meeting held on October 15th, 2020, and that said meeting was conducted and public notice of said meeting was given pursuant to and in full compliance with the Open Meetings Act, being Act 267, Public Acts of 1976, and that the minutes of said meeting were kept and will be or have been made available as required by said Act.

Steven Radtke
Chairperson, Historic District Commission

36662191.1\088888-01672