

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

November 2, 2021

Chairperson S. Radtke called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, K. George, S. Radtke

MEMBERS ABSENT: E. Trejo, excused

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, C. Cashin

OTHERS PRESENT: E. Rodriguez (126 Delaware); E. Bollweg (407 W. Muskegon); E. Crane (22 E. Southern)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of October 11, 2021 was made by A. Riegler, supported by K. George and approved with T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, K. George, and S. Radtke voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2021-36 – 126 Delaware Ave. – Entry Door

Applicant: E. Rodriguez - District: McLaughlin - Current Function: Residential

J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant was seeking approval to install a new 32"x80" entry door on the side porch in the location of the former door. J. Pesch explained that over 20 years ago, a previous owner removed the former door and covered the opening without HDC review or approval.

E. Rodriguez noted that, according to the house's previous owner, the original door closely resembled the existing front door. The board discussed the four proposed replacement entry door styles and compared them to the existing front door, as well as the door styles included in the HDC's Window, Door, and Exterior Woodwork Standards and Guidelines. The board agreed that a 3/4 lite door with clear glass and a simple panel detail was preferred, and that the proposed options that contained decorative glass would not be appropriate. S. Radtke noted that a 1/4 lite door with a 3 over 3 window configuration with clear glass could also be an appropriate option if additional security was desired.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to install a new 32"x80" entry door on the side porch in one of the following styles and in the location of the former door: 1) full lite with clear glass, 2) 3/4 lite with clear glass and a simple panel detail at the base, or 3) 1/4 lite with a 3 over 3 window configuration with clear glass as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by A. Riegler, supported by S. Radtke and approved with T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, K. George, and S. Radtke voting aye.

Case 2021-37 – 407 W. Muskegon Ave. – Windows

Applicant: E. Bollweg and D. Bollweg - District: Houston - Current Function: Residential

J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant was seeking approval to replace 50 existing wood windows with custom, Ultrex Fiberglass windows of the same size and muntin arrangements and to wrap the damaged window frames with formed aluminum, maintaining the original profile of the woodwork.

A. Riegler asked if all the windows were in a condition similar to that of those depicted in the photos shared. E. Bollweg stated that all windows were in similar condition, noting that the proposed replacement windows would match the existing windows' mullion patterns and would be constructed of fiberglass rather than vinyl. The board agreed that the material would be preferable.

The board expressed concerns about the ability of formed aluminum to maintain the original profile of the woodwork if the window frames were wrapped. E. Bollweg stated that because the house was finished in stucco, the wood window frames were essentially built in; aside from wrapping them in aluminum, it would be difficult to do anything to preserve or replace the wood window frames without damaging them. S. Radtke stated that the profile of the window frames was fairly simple and that the windows appeared to have serious dry rot.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace 50 existing wood windows with custom, Ultrex Fiberglass windows of the same size and muntin arrangements and to wrap the damaged window frames with formed aluminum, maintaining the original profile of the woodwork as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by K. George, supported by A. Riegler and approved with T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, K. George, and S. Radtke voting aye.

Case 2021-38 (Walk-on) – 22 E. Southern Ave. – Porch Railing

Applicant: E. Crane - District: Clinton-Peck - Current Function: Residential

The board agreed to review a walk-on case regarding a new porch railing proposed at 22 E. Southern Avenue. E. Crane explained that her insurance company was requiring that a new railing be installed around the front porch of the house. She was seeking approval to install a new, prefabricated 36"-tall porch rail around the front porch.

J. Pesch provided a photo of the house with its original railing that had been removed many years ago without HDC review or approval; he noted that the railing in the photo appeared to not meet the minimum 36" height required by modern building codes. The board discussed the proposed, prefabricated railing options and determined that the railing style closest to the original would be preferred. S. Radtke described how the railing could be constructed to match the original height but altered to meet modern building codes in a way that would be less visible. It was discussed whether the prefabricated railing could be constructed without requiring new posts between the existing columns to support the standard, six-foot lengths of the prefabricated railings. The board determined that a prefabricated option likely would not work due to the need for additional posts to support it.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to install a new, 36"-tall porch rail around the front porch with the conditions that it match the original railing's appearance in concept, that it does not require the addition of new vertical posts between the porch's existing columns, and that the work meets all building code requirements as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by A. Riegler, supported by K. George and approved with T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, and K. George voting aye, and S. Radtke voting no.

OTHER BUSINESS

Local Standards for Sheds – Staff had drafted general design standards based on recent conditions of approval used by the HDC and was seeking consent to add them to the Guidelines for New Construction. Doing so would

still require all requests for new sheds to come before the HDC, and the design guidelines would be meant to simplify the board's review process for proposed sheds that meet these standards.

A motion that the HDC approve a change to the Muskegon Historic District Commission local standards in updating the Guidelines for New Construction to include the section on sheds presented at the November 2, 2021 HDC meeting was made by T. Emory, supported by K. George and approved with T. Emory, A. Riegler, D. Gregersen, K. George, and S. Radtke voting aye.

Free Online Workshops – Staff shared information regarding two free, online workshops being hosted in November by the National Trust for Historic Preservation.

ADJOURN

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:38 p.m.

JP