

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Tuesday, November 5, 2019
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: **Conference Room 203, City Hall**

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order
- II. Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of October 1, 2019
- III. New Business
 - Case 2019-25 – 1561 Peck – Windows
 - Case 2019-26 – 621 W. Western – Siding
- IV. Old Business
- V. Other Business
- VI. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETING OF THE
CITY COMMISSION AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting, upon twenty-four hour notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or calling the following: Ann Marie Cummings, City Clerk at 933 Terrace Street, Muskegon, MI 49440 or by calling (231) 724-6705 or TTY/TDD: Dial 7-1-1 and request that representative dial 231-724-6705

II. MINUTES

Minutes to be added.

III. NEW BUSINESS

Case 2019-25 – 1561 Peck – Windows
Applicant: Elazar Group/Kurtis Fowler
District: Clinton-Peck
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to eliminate three existing windows (currently boarded-up), two on the second floor and one on the first floor, on the north and west façades of the house. The remaining openings will be sided to match the existing siding on the house. The work has been partially completed. This case was last reviewed at the November 6, 2018 HDC meeting. The minutes from that meeting are included below.



2018 photo showing boarded-up windows on North and West façades of 1561 Peck (viewed from Southern Ave.)

Minutes from November 6, 2018:

Case 2018-41 – 1561 Peck St – Windows. Applicant: Kurtis Fowler. District: Clinton-Peck. Current Function: Residential. J. Pesch stated that the applicant was seeking approval to replace 21 wood windows with vinyl windows of the same size and design. Three existing windows (currently boarded-up) on the north and west façades are proposed to be eliminated. The work had already been partially completed without HDC approval; a stop-work order had been placed on the house, as no building permit had been obtained either.

Board members were unhappy that most of the work had been done without approval, and that most of the windows had already been replaced. They concurred that they could not deny the request to replace the windows since the original windows were already gone. They requested that staff look into what action could be taken by the HDC and that fines be levied if possible. They agreed that they would not approve the removal of the boarded-up windows.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace 21 wood windows with vinyl windows of the same size and design as long as the necessary permits are obtained, and to deny the request to eliminate three existing windows currently boarded-up on the north and west façades, was made by S. Radtke, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, S. Radtke, L. Wood, and K. Panozzo voting aye.

Standards

General

These guidelines pertain only to proposed changes to the structure and do not affect existing construction.

These guidelines are primarily directed toward the front and side elevations of the structure. Greater variances and more leniency may be extended toward proposed changes to the rear elevation of the building by the Commission. All desired or proposed changes should be referred to the Historic District Commission for consideration. Extenuating circumstances, the effect upon the architecture of the particular structure together with the general effect upon the surrounding structures, variables in architectural design, or the effect upon usage and viability of the structure could dictate a variance from these guidelines.

No exterior doors, windows, or exterior woodwork shall be altered, removed, relocated, or added without Historic District Commission approval.

Existing exterior window or door casings, sills, and caps shall not be altered from the original design or appearance. Damaged or deteriorated wood shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Damaged or deteriorated wood elements may be replaced or covered with formed aluminum or vinyl, subject to Commission approval and provided that the original profile of the woodwork is not altered or changed.

Primary Windows

Existing damaged or deteriorating window frames and sash shall be repaired as a first course of action. When repair is not possible, elements shall be replaced with matching wood members. Metal or vinyl replacement windows may be acceptable provided they match the original windows in design and type and that they consist of or are painted an appropriate color. Bare metal finishes generally will not be acceptable.

The size of glass lites and muntin arrangements shall not be altered without Commission approval. Special glazing, such as stained or leaded art glass, shall not be removed without Commission approval. Unusual decorative windows such as Palladian windows, oriels, bays, Gothic arch or segment tops, etc. shall not be removed or altered.

Storm Windows

Wood storm and screen windows are the most appropriate for use in the historic district. Other types of storm, screen, or combination windows will be approved provided that the new storm window mullions align with the mullions of the primary windows. Blind stop storm and screen windows (where such windows are placed inside the existing window frames rather than affixed to the exterior of the frames) are preferable and may be required in some instances. Bare metal storm and screen windows must be painted to match or complement the trim. Interior storm windows may be acceptable as long as they do not detract from the appearance of the primary windows. Care should be taken, however, when using interior storm windows because condensation tends to form on the inside surface of the primary window and could cause damage to the wood and paint if not properly ventilated.

Primary Doors

Every effort should be made to preserve or repair the original doors where damage has occurred. When repair is not possible, a new wood door may be used. Such new door shall match the original in detail and finish.

The Commission may approve new wood doors that may slightly differ from the original in cases where replicating the original may not be feasible, as long as such doors generally conform to the ones illustrated on the attached sheet. Under certain circumstances, the Commission may approve doors made of material other than wood provided they conform to the same design requirements.

Storm Doors

Wooden storm and screen doors are preferred and will generally be the required option especially on the front of the structure. Aluminum or metal storm and screen doors may be used so long as they are not mill finished or anodized aluminum. Baked enamel or other applicable paints or finishes will be acceptable. In general, storm and screen doors shall conform to those illustrated on the attached sheet. The door stiles and rails should be a minimum of 4" wide and one lite doors, where practical, are preferred in order not to detract from the existing primary door. Jalousie doors are not acceptable for use as storm doors in the historic districts. Ornamental iron work safety doors are also generally inappropriate in the historic districts.

Exterior Woodwork

Existing decorative woodwork such as railings, moldings, eave, and gable cornice trim, tracery, columns, observatories, scrolls, bargeboards, lattice, and other carved or sawn wood ornament shall not be removed or altered without Commission approval. Existing deteriorated ornamental woodwork shall not be removed but shall be repaired or replaced with matching materials where possible.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to eliminate three existing windows (currently boarded-up), two on the second floor and one on the first floor, on the north and west façades of the house and to side the three remaining openings to match the existing siding on the house as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

Case 2019-26 – 621 W. Western – Siding
Applicant: Muskegon Eagles
District: Clay-Western
Current Function: Recreational

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to cover the east-facing wall on the second floor with sheet steel siding due to continued damage to the brick and sealing repairs.



View of 621 W. Western from Western Avenue



View of damaged area, exposing brick. Wall was sealed a few years ago, but damage continues

Standards

General

The Muskegon Historic District Commission does not endorse the residing of structures within the Historic districts. It is the policy of this Commission that the original fabric of the building should be repaired or replaced where necessary with the original building material.

In cases where the repair or replacement with like materials is impractical or where it can be demonstrated that the original materials will no longer hold paint or that the original materials are so badly

deteriorated that they can no longer be reasonably repaired, the residing standards below shall strictly be adhered to.

Definitions

For the purpose of this statement, the terms “residing materials” and “trim cladding” shall be understood to encompass the use of any residing materials such as aluminum, vinyl, steel, hardboard, wood, masonry, or molded urethane which is designed to replace or cover all, or any part, of an exterior wall, trim work or other building element or a structure within a designated historic district.

Purpose

The Commission shall review all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness proposing the installation of residing materials or trim cladding as individual cases. Each application shall be decided on its own merit. No person should interpret any Commission approval for residing or trim cladding as being precedent setting. Unrestricted use of residing materials or trim cladding will not be allowed.

In any case where residing materials or trim cladding are proposed for use by a property owner or siding contractor, the property owner shall be required to submit a signed letter stating in detail the intent and scope of the proposed residing or trim cladding installation. Such a letter is to also include the identification of any deterioration or problems occurring relative to the existing siding or exterior building fabric. If known, the cause and extent of this deterioration must be clearly stated.

The following conditions of installation shall be met by all proposals for residing or trim cladding:

1. All existing deterioration shall be made structurally sound and its causes, insofar as possible, shall be corrected prior to the installation of residing materials or trim cladding.
2. Any installation of residing materials shall simulate the appearance of the original building material that it is intended to cover. This simulation shall take into account the size, shape or profile, texture, and linear direction of the original building material.
 - a. The residing material shall be similar in appearance and dimension to the original siding. The exposure to the weather of the new siding shall range within one inch of the nominal dimension of the original siding. The Historic District Commission shall have the authority to waive this requirement in the event that they believe a different design or dimension siding would be more appropriate to the architectural character of the Historic District.
 - b. A proposed color shall be appropriate as determined by the Commission.
 - c. Generally, wood grain textures are not approved by the Commission. However, the appropriateness of a specific siding texture shall be determined on an individual case basis.
3. Any installation of trim cladding shall adhere to the following guidelines for the treatment for architectural trim elements.

- a. Existing cornice or building trim elements shall not be covered or replaced without Commission approval. Commission approval will depend upon how closely the trim cladding or new trim elements duplicate the appearance of the existing building trim elements.
- b. The wall siding material shall not extend over the existing trim members such as window and door trim, sills, facias, soffits, frieze members and boards, brackets, aprons, corner boards, trim boards, skirt boards, or any other characteristic moldings or architectural features.
- c. If the above mentioned trim members are to be clad, they shall be covered with custom formed cladding which shall closely approximate the shapes and contours of the existing moldings or trim. Distinctive or unusual trim or architectural elements shall not be clad without prior consideration and Commission approval.
- d. No building trim elements or architectural features are to be removed or altered to facilitate the installation of the new siding or trim cladding without approval of the Historic District Commission.
- e. In most cases the soffit cladding material shall run parallel and not perpendicular to the plane of the wall.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to cover the east-facing wall on the second floor with sheet steel siding as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.

IV. OLD BUSINESS

None

V. OTHER BUSINESS

None

VI. ADJOURN